

IEEE SA guidelines for commenting on draft standards in Standards Association ballot (Balloters)

General Guidelines

- Balloters are responsible for reviewing the draft, responses to comments, and supporting documentation (e.g., PAR, ballot announcement, cover letter) throughout the balloting process.
- Comments are to be submitted in myProject, or alternatively, in an electronic file in one of the formats indicated in myProject (search for “Vote and/or Comment on a Ballot” in the IEEE SA Support Portal for submittal instructions).
- Each comment should reference a specific sub-clause, line, paragraph, figure, and/or equation in the balloted draft.
- A valid comment should identify:
 - A specific issue and the proposed change in sufficient detail so that the Comment Resolution Group (CRG) can revise the draft so that the draft may satisfy the commenter.
- Comments should NOT be:
 - Vague
 - *For example, "This paragraph is wrong, fix it" is not a valid comment.*
 - Ask questions without proposing a specific change
 - Request changes in other documents beside the specific document under ballot, or in potential future revisions of the current project (such comments are out of scope).

Content of Comments

- Comments relating to general issues that affect multiple sections should be referenced to the first or most prominent instance of the issue. It is acceptable to have one comment that covers multiple instances of a single issue instead of entering multiple comments.
- If necessary, an individual comment submitted in myProject may be supplemented by supporting documents Some examples of acceptable attachment files are:
 - A marked-up copy of a figure, table or equation indicating corrections or changes needed.

- A replacement figure, table, or equation that the comment suggests be added or suggests as a replacement of an existing item in the balloted draft.
- Revised text to replace or add an entire subclause or paragraph, exceeding the capacity of the comments form.
- All or part of the balloted draft that has been marked up with comments (e.g. by hand and then scanned, or using Word change tracking, or by inserting PDF comments) that relates to multiple issues or relates to multiple lines, paragraphs, figures, or equations in the balloted draft.

Balloting Process – Scope of Comments

- During the initial ballot, any part of the draft standard is in scope for comments. Once the draft standard has reached 75% approval, comments are in scope only for material in the balloted draft that is:
 - changed since the previous draft, or material affected by that change
 - related to a "must be satisfied" comment from the previous round of balloting
 - related to a previous comment response that was not properly applied. It is the responsibility of the balloters to carefully examine the draft to confirm that it is consistent with the comment disposition and disposition detail from the previous ballot.