IEEE-SA Standards Board Standards Review Committee (RevCom) Meeting Minutes
9 September 2011
9:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m. KST
Seoul, South Korea

Members Present
Masayuki Ariyoshi
William Bartley
Alex Gelman
Gary Hoffman
Bruce Kraemer
David Law, Chair
Gary Robinson

Guests
Wael Diab
Robert Grow
Richard Hulett
Claire Topp [legal counsel]

Staff
Bill Ash
Karen Evangelista, Administrator
Judy Gorman
Mary Ellen Hanntz
Karen Kenney
Sue Vogel

Members Absent
Satish Aggarwal
Ted Burse
Clint Chaplin
Paul Houzé
Oleg Logvinov
Philip Winston

1 CALL TO ORDER
Chair Law called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. There was a round of introductions by all present.

2 REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA
There was a motion to approve the agenda. The motion was unanimously approved.

3 APPROVAL OF THE 15 June 2011 MINUTES
There was a motion to approve the 15 June 2011 RevCom Minutes. The motion was unanimously approved.

4 ProCom LIAISON REPORT
William Bartley, ProCom member, delivered the report. [Please see the ProCom meeting minutes for further information.]
# 5 CONDITIONAL APPROVAL REPORT

The report was given as an information item.

**P802.1Qbb/D2.3 (C/LM) Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Virtual Bridged Local Area Networks - Amendment: Priority-based Flow Control**

Recommendation: Conditionally approve
There was a motion to conditionally approve P802.1Qbb conditional upon the SASB approval of P802.1Qaz.

**FINAL APPROVAL DATE: 16 June 2011**

**P802.3bd/D2.2 (C/LM) Standard for Information Technology - Telecommunications and Information Exchange Between Systems – Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Specific Requirements Part 3: Carrier Sense Multiple Access with Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) Access Method and Physical Layer Specifications - Amendment: MAC Control Frame for Priority-based Flow Control**

Recommendation: Conditionally approve
There was a motion to conditionally approve P802.3bd conditional upon the SASB approval of P802.1Qbb.

**FINAL APPROVAL DATE: 16 June 2011**


Recommendation: Conditionally Approve
There was a motion to approve P21451-7 conditional on SASB approval of the modified PAR.

**FINAL APPROVAL DATE: 16 June 2011**

# 6 PROPOSED STANDARDS FOR REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION

[All votes unanimous unless noted otherwise.]

## 6.1 New

**P45.2/D07 (IAS/PCI) Recommended Practice for Electrical Installations on Shipboard - Controls and Automation**

Recommendation: APPROVE
P802.1AEbn/D0.8 (C/LM) Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks: Media Access Control (MAC) Security Amendment 1: Galois Counter Mode- Advanced Encryption Standard-256 (GCM-AES-256) Cipher Suite

Recommendation: APPROVE

P802.1BA/D2.6 (C/LM) Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Audio Video Bridging (AVB) Systems

Recommendation: APPROVE

P802.11s/D12.0 (CLM) Standard for Information Technology - Telecommunications and Information Exchange Between Systems – Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Specific Requirements - Part 11: Wireless LAN Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specifications Amendment 10: Mesh Networking

Recommendation: APPROVE [5=yes, 0=no, 1=abstain (Kraemer)]

P807/D8 (PE/ED&PG) Recommended Practice for Unique Identification in Hydroelectric Facilities

Recommendation: APPROVE


Recommendation: Conditionally approve
There was a motion to conditionally approve P1453 conditional upon the SASB approval of the modified PAR. There was discussion about the numbering schemes used in the draft, the use of a comma versus a period.

AI: Karen to ask the editors to come up with a statement to go in the front matter to explain the numbering in future documents.

P1547.6/D8 (SASB/SCC21) Recommended Practice for Interconnecting Distributed Resources with Electric Power Systems Distribution Secondary Networks

Recommendation: APPROVE
**P1591.3/D7 (PE/PSC) Standard for Qualifying Hardware for Helically-Applied Fiber Optic Cable Systems (WRAP Cable)**

Recommendation: APPROVE

**P1682/D4 (PE/ICC) Trial-Use Standard for Qualifying Fiber Optic Cables, Connections and Optical Fiber Splices for Use in Safety Systems of Nuclear Power Generating Stations**

Recommendation: APPROVE

**P1903/D2 (COM/SC) Standard for the Functional Architecture of Next Generation Service Overlay Networks**

Recommendation: Conditionally approve

There was a motion to conditionally approve P1903 conditional upon the SASB approval of the modified PAR.

**P2030/D7 (SASB/SCC21) Guide for Smart Grid Interoperability of Energy Technology and Information Technology Operation with the Electric Power System (EPS), and End-Use Applications and Loads**

Recommendation: APPROVE


Recommendation: APPROVE

**P15289/D4 (C/S2ESC) Standard for Software and Systems Engineering - Content of Life-Cycle Information Products (Documentation)**

Recommendation: Conditionally approve

There was a motion to conditionally approve P15289 conditional upon the SASB approval of the modified PAR.

**P11073-10406/D11 (EMB/11073) Health Informatics - Personal Health Device Communication - Device Specialization - Basic Electrocardiograph (ECG) (1 to 3-lead ECG)**

Recommendation: APPROVE
**P11073-10418/D15** (EMB/11073) Health Informatics - Personal Health Device Communication - Device Specialization - International Normalized Ratio (INR) Monitor

**Recommendation:** APPROVE

**PC37.47/D6** (PE/SWG) Standard Specifications for High Voltage (> 1000 V) Current-Limiting Type Distribution Class Fuses and Fuse Disconnecting Switches

**Recommendation:** APPROVE

**PC57.148/D11** (PE/TR) Standard for Control Cabinets for Power Transformers

**Recommendation:** APPROVE

### 6.2 Revision

**P1349/D9.4** (IAS/PCI) Guide for the Application of Electric Motors in Class I, Division 2 and Class I, Zone 2 Hazardous (Classified) Locations

**Recommendation:** APPROVE


**Recommendation:** APPROVE

### 6.3 Reaffirmation

Since a number of submittals had received no comments, there was a motion to approve 572-2006, 1106-2005 and 1175.2-2006. **The motion was approved unanimously.**

**572-2006** (PE/NPE) IEEE Standard for Qualification of Class 1E Connection Assemblies for Nuclear Power Generating Stations

**Recommendation:** APPROVE

**1106-2005** (PE/SB) IEEE Recommended Practice for Installation, Maintenance, Testing, and Replacement of Vented Nickel-Cadmium Batteries for Stationary Applications

**Recommendation:** APPROVE
1115-2000 (R2005) (PE/SB) IEEE Recommended Practice for Sizing Nickel-Cadmium Batteries for Stationary Applications

**Recommendation:** APPROVE [4=yes, 1=no (Bartley), 1=abstain (Hoffman)]

1175.2-2006 (C/S2ESC) IEEE Recommended Practice for CASE Tool Interconnection - Characterization of Interconnections

**Recommendation:** APPROVE

7 EARLY CONSIDERATION PROCESS

Chair Law stated that the next Early Consideration teleconference would be held on Tuesday, 18 October 2011, 10:00 a.m. to Noon EDT. The deadline for submittals, on a first come first serve basis, was 13 September 2011.

8 OLD BUSINESS

8.1 ACTION ITEM REVIEW

Open action items were reviewed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action Item</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recusal/Abstention Definition</td>
<td>Approved by RevCom, Chair Law to take to ProCom. Added as a RevCom convention.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution of Match Rule presentation slides to RevCom</td>
<td>RevCom Administrator sent presentation to RevCom.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribute RevCom Automation presentation slides to RevCom for comments</td>
<td>RevCom Administrator sent presentation to RevCom and coordinated comments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines for Providing Comment Resolution to Balloters Ad Hoc.</td>
<td>Draft completed, teleconference 8/11/11. Draft was revised and sent to ad hoc for comments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bruce Kraemer to chair, David Law, Clint Chaplin, Gary Hoffman, Robert Grow, Pat Thaler, Dave Ringle, Christina Boyce and Karen Evangelista are members.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When a vote flip occurs, balloting officers are to be informed.</td>
<td>This is being automated, ready to be rolled out 9/14/11.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the discussion about the RevCom Automation, the topic came up about having a feature in myProject/myBallot regarding outstanding negatives. Some committee
members thought it would be helpful to add a feature that allows a “roll-up” of comments in order to easily see which ones are still outstanding.

**AI: Chair Law to talk to Christina Boyce about how this can be done in myProject/myBallot.**

### 8.2 Guidelines for Providing Comment Resolution to Balloters Ad Hoc – Kraemer

Bruce Kraemer reported on the ad hoc’s discussion about the draft for the Guidelines for Providing Comment Resolution to Balloters. The ad hoc was formed after discussion on the responses submitters were giving to balloters and how this could impede a project from being approved by RevCom. A draft of guidelines included providing correct instructions to members of the Ballot group while adhering to the IEEE Code of Ethics and the IEEE Standards Board Operations Manual. Also discussed was the use of cross-referencing, referencing an outside document, and referencing an URL, and how this needs to be clarified.

During discussion, it was noted that sections on balloters’ responsibility and interpretation requests should be added. Gary Hoffman and Bob Grow, respectively, will draft these two sections. The entire document will be ready to send to RevCom for comments before the December meeting so that it can be voted on at that time.

There was discussion on how this document would be distributed including posting it on the RevCom Conventions webpage, on the myBallot Home management page and in the “Invitation to Ballot” email. There was also discussion about notifying balloters when a project is submitted to RevCom.

### 9 NEW BUSINESS

#### 9.1 Match Rule RevCom Convention – Law

David Law introduced the topic of the Match Rule in the RevCom Conventions. As it stands the use of the Match Rule increased the number of Modified PARs that were submitted to NesCom. This should be the balloters’ responsibility and as such, a request was made to the SA Standards Board to remove the Match Rule.

In conjunction with this change, the RevCom Checklist will be updated with the following:

If sponsor balloting was initiated after 30 June 2011, RevCom does not need to review the scope and purpose text. If sponsor balloting was initiated prior to 1 July 2011 do the Purpose and Scope of the submitted draft match the ones in the PAR (does not apply to amendments or corrigenda)? *
a. If the PAR was approved prior to 1 January 2007, the scope and purpose (if included) need to be within the scope and purpose of the PAR.
b. If the PAR was approved on or after 1 January 2007, the scope and purpose (if included) shall match the PAR’s scope and purpose.

**AI: Karen to submit a web request to have this change made to the RevCom Checklist.**

During discussion, RevCom members noted that there is an error in the automated email from myBallot. It should state that a balloter can comment on the entire document if the 75% mark has not been achieved.

**AI: David Ringle to change the text in the recirculation announcement email.**

**10 NEXT MEETING**

The next RevCom meeting will be Tuesday 6 December 2011, in Piscataway, NJ. The submittal deadline for this meeting is 17 October 2011.

**11 ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:45 a.m. KST.