



**IEEE DySPAN Standards Committee (DySPAN-SC)**

**Date of Submittal: (Revised) 30 July 2014**

**Date of Acceptance: 21 August 2014**

## **IEEE DySPAN Standards Committee (DySPAN-SC) Policies and Procedures for Standards Development**

### **1.0 Introduction**

In today's market, standards development plays a critical role in product development and market share. In the IEEE, the responsibility for how a standard originates and evolves is managed by a Sponsor. It is essential in the management of a standard's development to avoid any actions by the Sponsor or the participants that result in a violation of procedures.

Adherence to these Policies and Procedures is an essential asset in determining the applicability of IEEE's indemnification policy.

These Policies and Procedures outline the orderly transaction of standards activities of DySPAN-SC, herein after referred to as "the Sponsor" or appropriate related form. For the development of standards, openness and due process shall be applied, which means that any person with a direct and material interest who meets the requirements of these Policies and Procedures has a right to participate by:

- a) Expressing a position and its basis
- b) Having that position considered, and
- c) Appealing if adversely affected

Due process allows for equity and fair play. In addition, due process requires openness and balance (i.e., the standards development process should strive to have a balance of interests and not to be dominated by any single interest category). However, for the IEEE Standards Sponsor ballot, there shall be a balance of interests without dominance by any single interest category.

Participants engaged in the development of standards must comply with applicable federal, state, and international laws. In addition, for standards matters, the latest versions of several documents take precedence over this document, in the following order:

[New York State Not-for-Profit Corporation Law](#)

[IEEE Certificate of Incorporation](#)

[IEEE Constitution](#)

[IEEE Bylaws](#)

[IEEE Policies](#)

[IEEE Board of Directors Resolutions](#)

[IEEE Standards Association Operations Manual](#)

[IEEE-SA Board of Governors Resolutions](#)

[IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws](#)

[IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual](#)

[IEEE-SA Standards Board Resolutions](#)

IEEE Communications Society Standards Development Board Policies and Procedures  
IEEE Communications Society Standards Development Board Resolutions  
**Policies and Procedures of IEEE DySPAN Standards Committee (DySPAN-SC)**

Anything the Sponsor creates is hierarchically inferior to the documents and resolutions that are listed above its Policies and Procedures. The Policies and Procedures of the Sponsor are hierarchically superior to other documents of the Sponsor. *Robert's Rules of Order Newly Revised (RONR)* is the recommended guide on questions of parliamentary procedure not addressed in these procedures.

### **1.1 IEEE Sponsor scope**

The Sponsor develops standards related to dynamic spectrum access networks. The focus is on improved use of spectrum. New techniques and methods of dynamic spectrum access require managing interference, coordination of wireless technologies and include network management and information sharing.

### **1.2 Organization of the Sponsor**

The Sponsor shall consist of officers (see Clause 3), and other members.

### **2.0 Responsibilities of the Sponsor**

The Sponsor shall be responsible for at least the following:

- a) Developing proposed IEEE standards and ensuring that they are within the scope of the Sponsor.
- b) Initiating and overseeing ballots of proposed IEEE standards within its scope, including:
  - 1) Approving Project Authorization Requests (PARs\_ from a subgroup or the Sponsor

- 2) Submitting a proposed PAR to the IEEE-SA Standards Board for consideration. Following approval of the PAR, the Sponsor shall submit necessary requests for extension, modification, or withdrawal of the PAR as required by the IEEE-SA Operations Manual
  - 3) Submitting draft standards from a subgroup or the Sponsor to the IEEE-SA for Sponsor ballot.
- c) Maintaining the standards developed by the Sponsor in accordance with the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*
  - d) Acting on other matters requiring Sponsor effort as provided in these procedures
  - e) Cooperating with other appropriate standards development organizations
  - f) Protecting against actions taken in the name of the Sponsor without proper Sponsor authorization
  - g) Limiting distribution of the membership roster to appropriate parties
  - h) Communicating with the IEEE-SA Standards Board on specific Sponsor activities as needed
  - i) Handling appeals as described in Clause 9

## **2.1 Sponsorship**

The Sponsor is responsible for the development and coordination of standards project(s) including their maintenance after their approval as standard(s) by the IEEE-SA Standards Board. Specifically, the Sponsor is responsible for those IEEE-SA Standards Board approved project(s) for which the Sponsor has been identified or assigned as either the sole sponsor or a joint sponsor. The development and maintenance of standards shall be accomplished as defined within the clauses of these Policies and Procedures.

### **2.1.1 Joint-Sponsor responsibility/accountability**

The Sponsor shall complete a joint sponsorship agreement for jointly sponsored projects.

## **3.0 Officers**

There shall be a Chair, a Vice Chair, a Treasurer and a Secretary. A person may simultaneously hold the positions of Treasurer and another office, other than Chair.

The Chair shall be a member of any grade of the IEEE and a member of the IEEE-SA. (IEEE-SASB Bylaw 5.2.1) The officers shall organize the Sponsor; oversee the Sponsor's compliance with these Policies and Procedures; and submit proposed documents approved by the Sponsor (with supporting documentation) for appropriate review and approval by the IEEE-SA Standards Board. Officers shall read the training material available through [IEEE Standards Development Online](#).

### **3.1 Election or appointment of officers**

Officers shall be elected in accordance with the procedures of ComSoc Standards Development Board (COM/SDB). An officer may serve any number of consecutive terms.

There shall be an annual vote of the Sponsor to recommend a Sponsor Chair to the COM/SDB. After appointment of the Sponsor Chair by the COM/SDB, the Sponsor Chair shall appoint a Vice Chair, Treasurer, and Secretary.

The voting members of the Sponsor shall initiate a ballot to recommend a candidate for Sponsor Chair. The recommended candidate may then be appointed by the COM/SDB. If the COM/SDB declines to appoint the recommended candidate as Sponsor Chair or appoint another person as Sponsor Chair, then another Sponsor ballot may be initiated to recommend a different candidate for Sponsor Chair. The appointment of Sponsor Chair shall be for the calendar year, but the Chair may serve until a successor is appointed.

The voting members of the Sponsor shall nominate to the Elections Officer one or more voting members for the position of Sponsor Chair. Nominees shall be eligible to hold the office of Sponsor Chair. Upon written notification, the nominee has 14 calendar days to indicate acceptance or rejection of the nomination. If no nomination is received or accepted for the office of Sponsor Chair, the COM/SDB may appoint the Sponsor Chair. The Chair shall appoint the Vice Chair, Treasurer, and Secretary from the slate of those nominated for each office. Nonmembers can be nominated and appointed to offices other than the Chair.

### **3.2 Temporary appointments to vacancies**

If an office other than the Chair becomes vacant for any reason (such as resignation, removal, lack of nomination at an election), a temporary appointment shall be made by the Chair for a period of up to 12 months. An appointment or election for the vacated office shall be made in accordance with requirements in Clause 3.0 and Clause 3.1.

### 3.3 Removal of officers

An officer (other than the chair) may be removed by a two-thirds vote of the voting members of the Sponsor. Grounds for removal shall be included in any motion to remove an officer. The officer suggested for removal shall be given an opportunity to make a rebuttal prior to the vote on the motion for removal.

### 3.4 Responsibilities of officers

The officers of the Sponsor shall manage the day-to-day work of the Sponsor. The officers are responsible for implementing the decisions of the Sponsor and managing the activities that result from those decisions.

#### 3.4.1 Chair

The responsibilities of the Chair shall include

- a) Leading the activity according to all of the relevant policies and procedures
- b) Forming study groups, as necessary
- c) Being objective
- d) Entertaining motions, but not making motions
- e) Not biasing discussions
- f) Delegating necessary functions
- g) Ensuring that all parties have the opportunity to express their views
- h) Setting goals and deadlines and adhering to them
- i) Being knowledgeable in IEEE standards processes and parliamentary procedures and ensuring that the processes and procedures are followed
- j) Seeking consensus of the Sponsor as a means of resolving issues
- k) Prioritizing work to best serve the Sponsor and its goals
- l) Complying with the Chair's responsibility with respect to the IEEE-SA Intellectual Property Policies, including but not limited to the IEEE-SA Patent Policy (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.3.2, <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html>) and IEEE-SA Copyright Policy (see IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws 7, <http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#7> )
- m) Submitting approved Sponsor P&P to the IEEE-SA Standards Board Audit Committee (AudCom—see <http://standards.ieee.org/board/aud/index.html> )

- n) Ensuring that each Working group has a set of P&P approved by the Sponsor. The chair will provide the Working group P&Ps to AudCom upon request.
- o) Submitting appropriate Annual Financial Reports (IEEE SA Form L50-S) to the Business Manager, Business Administration, or assignee, for the operation of the Sponsor and all of its subgroups.

### **3.4.2 Vice-Chair**

The Vice Chair shall carry out the Chair's duties if the Chair is temporarily unable to do so or chooses to recuse him- or herself (e.g., to speak for or against a motion).

### **3.4.3 Secretary**

The responsibilities of the Secretary include:

- a) Scheduling meetings in coordination with the Chair and distributing a meeting notice at least 30 calendar days before the meeting
- b) Distributing the agenda at least 14 calendar days before the meeting—notification of the potential for action shall be included on any distributed agendas for meetings
- c) Recording minutes of each meeting and publishing them within 60 calendar days of the end of the meeting
- d) Creating and maintaining the participant roster and submitting it to the IEEE Standards Association annually
- e) Being responsible for the management and distribution of Sponsor documentation
- f) Maintaining lists of unresolved issues, action items, and assignments
- g) Recording attendance of all attendees
- h) Maintaining a current list of the names of the voting members and distributing it to the members upon request
- i) Forwarding all changes to the roster of voting members to the Chair

### **3.4.4 Treasurer**

Treasurer shall:

- a) Maintain a budget
- b) Control all funds, including any into and out of the Committee's bank account
- c) Follow IEEE policies concerning standards meetings and finances



- d) Adhere to the IEEE Finance Operations Manual

## **4.0 Membership**

### **4.1 Voting membership**

Voting membership shall be granted after the participant attends two out of three consecutive meetings in-person and also requests membership status as described in sub-clause 4.1.1.

Each voting member is expected to attend face-to-face meetings, teleconferences, and vote on the Sponsor's ballots as defined in this clause. To maintain membership an individual shall:

- a) Attend at least one out of two immediately previous meetings in-person,
- b) Attend at least one third of teleconferences (including internet conference calls) - if there are at least three - between two consecutive meetings, and
- c) Vote on at least one out of two consecutive ballots.

Nonmembers can join meetings and teleconferences.

Officers and Working Group Chairs are ex-officio voting members regardless of their attendance records.

#### **4.1.1 Application**

A request for membership shall be addressed to the Chair and to the Secretary in copy, indicating the applicant's direct and material interest in the Committee's work, qualifications and willingness to participate actively.

### **4.2 Review of membership**

The Chair shall review the voting membership list at the beginning of every face-to-face meeting. Voting members are expected to fulfill the obligations of active participation as defined in Clause 4.1. When a voting member is found in habitual default of these obligations, the Chair shall consider the matter for appropriate action which may include termination of membership.

#### **4.3 Membership roster**

A current and accurate Sponsor roster shall be maintained. Due to privacy concerns, the roster shall not be distributed except to the IEEE-SA Board of Governors, IEEE-SA Standards Board, and IEEE-SA staff unless all Sponsor members have submitted their written approval for such distribution. The roster shall include the following:

- a) Title of the Sponsor and its designation
- b) Scope of the Sponsor
- c) Officers: Chair, Vice Chair, Secretary, Treasurer
- d) Members: for all, name, e-mail address, affiliation and membership status.
- e) For each subgroup: subgroup title, Chair, and names, e-mail addresses, and affiliations of all members

#### **4.4 Membership public list**

A current and accurate Sponsor membership list shall be maintained. The membership list may be posted on the Sponsor web site and may be publically distributed. The membership list shall be limited to the following:

- a) Title of the Committee and its designation
- b) Scope of the Committee
- c) Officers: Chair, Vice Chair, Secretary, Treasurer
- d) Members: (for all) -- name, affiliation

### **5.0 Subgroups, Study Groups and Working groups created by the Sponsor**

#### **5.1 Administrative subgroups**

When one or more subgroups is formed to expedite the administrative work of the Sponsor (e.g., AdCom, ExCom), its formation (and later disbandment) requires a majority vote of the Sponsor as defined in Subclause 7.1.

## **5.2 Working groups – Individual Method**

Standards Working groups are responsible for the definitive content of one or more documents and for responding to views and objections thereon. Such Working groups shall maintain a membership roster and shall comply with the provisions for preparing standards. The Sponsor shall appoint the Working group chair.

The Sponsor shall ensure that all Working groups adopt procedures consistent with the baseline Operating Procedures for Standards Working Groups – Individual Method and review amendments to these procedures to ensure that they are not in conflict with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual.

## **5.3 Working groups – Entity Method**

If a Working group being formed has entity-based membership, the Sponsor shall ensure that the entity standards Working group adopts procedures consistent with the IEEE-SA Baseline Policies and Procedures – IEEE Standard WGs – Entity Working groups. In addition, the Sponsor reviews amendments to the Policies and Procedures for Corporate Standards Working groups to ensure that they are not in conflict with IEEE policies and procedures and New York State Not-for-Profit Corporation Law.

## **5.4 Standards study groups**

When a Sponsor is presented with a proposal concerning a standards development project, the Sponsor may form a Standards Study Group to examine the proposal to determine if there is a need for a standard to be developed. The life of a Standards Study Group is limited to 6 months. If the proposal merits formation of a project, the Study Group will draft a PAR for consideration by the Sponsor.

Groups shall refer to the approved Study Group guidelines on how a Standards Study Group shall conduct business and the criteria it shall apply to consideration of a proposal. Guidelines located at: <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/corpchan/studygrp.pdf>

A Study Group is disbanded upon approval of the PAR by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

## **5.5 Other subgroups**

The formation and disbandment of subgroups other than administrative subgroups (e.g., technical subcommittees, and writing groups) require approval by a majority vote of the Sponsor. The Chair of a subgroup shall be appointed by the Chair of the Sponsor or decided by nomination and election. The scope and duties delegated to the subgroup shall be approved at the time the subgroup is formed, and subsequent changes in scope or duties shall also require approval by a majority vote of the Sponsor. The scope, duties, and membership of all subgroups shall be reviewed annually by the Sponsor. The charge to the subgroup shall clearly state which of the following complementary activities is appropriate:

- 1) The subgroup is responsible for the definitive content of one or more documents and for responding to views and objections thereon. Such subgroups shall maintain a membership roster and shall comply with the provisions for preparing standard(s).
- 2) The subgroup is responsible for assisting the Sponsor (e.g., drafting all or a portion of a document, drafting responses to comments, drafting public statements on standards, or other purely advisory functions).

## **6.0 Meetings**

Sponsor meetings may be conducted either exclusively in-person or in-person with one or more participants contributing via electronic means, or exclusively via electronic means. Sponsor meetings shall be held, as decided by the Sponsor Chair, or by petition of 5 or more voting members, to conduct business such as making assignments, receiving reports of work, progressing draft standards, resolving differences among subgroups, and considering views and objections from any source. A meeting notice shall be distributed to all members at least 30 days in advance of the meeting. A meeting agenda shall be distributed to all members at least 14 days in advance of the meeting. Meetings of subgroups may be held as decided upon by the members or Chair of the subgroup. Notification of the potential for action shall be included on any distributed agendas for meetings.

Note that all IEEE Standards development meetings are open to anyone who has a material interest and wishes to attend. However some meetings may occur in Executive Session (see Clause 6.3).

### **6.1 Quorum**

A quorum shall be identified before the initiation of Sponsor business at a meeting, but if a quorum is not present, actions may be taken subject to confirmation by letter or electronic ballot, as detailed in Clause 7.4. When the voting membership is less than 50 voting members, a quorum shall be defined as a majority of the current total voting membership. When the voting membership is 50 or more voting members, a quorum shall be defined as 10% of the current total voting membership or 26, whichever is greater. Voting members who recuse themselves shall not be counted in the equation to determine whether a quorum exists.

## **6.2 Conduct**

Meeting attendees shall demonstrate respect and courtesy toward each other and shall allow each participant a fair and equal opportunity to contribute to the meeting, in accordance with the IEEE Code of Ethics.

All Working group participants shall act in accordance with all IEEE Standards policies and procedures.

## **6.3 Executive session**

Meetings to discuss personnel or sensitive business matters (e.g., the negotiation of contracts), or for other appropriate non-public matters (e.g., the receipt of legal advice), may be conducted in Executive Session.

## **6.4 Meeting fees**

The Sponsor may charge a meeting fee to cover the expenses of the Sponsor. The fee shall not be used to restrict participation by any interested parties. The Sponsor Officers shall set the meeting fees in consultation with those planning a particular meeting.

Everyone who attends a meeting, except for those specifically excluded due to hardship, shall pay the meeting fee. In the event that a member of the Sponsor has a financial difficulty and is unable to pay the meeting fee, the member may apply to the Sponsor Chair for a partial or complete waiver of the meeting fee. The Chair and Treasurer shall make the decision to grant such relief. These discussions shall remain private.

## **6.5 Minutes**

The minutes shall record the essentials, including the following:

- a) Name of group
- b) Date and location of meeting
- c) Officer presiding, including the name of the secretary who wrote the minutes
- d) Attendance, including affiliation
- e) Call to order, Chair's remarks
- f) Approval of minutes of previous meeting
- g) Approval of agenda
- h) Technical topics
  - 1) Brief summary of discussions and conclusions
  - 2) Motions, including the names of mover and seconder.
- i) Items reported out of executive session
- j) Next meeting--date and location

Copies of handouts and subcommittee reports may be included in the minutes or made available as separate items.

## **7.0 Vote**

### **7.1 Approval of an action**

Approval of an action requires approval by a majority (or two-thirds) vote as specified below in 7.1.1 (majority), and 7.1.2 (two-thirds). The “majority, two-thirds vote” is defined as one of the following:

- a) At a meeting (including teleconferences) where quorum has been established, a vote carried by majority (or two-thirds) approval of the votes cast (i.e., Approve or Do Not Approve votes, excluding abstentions) by the voting members in attendance.
- b) By electronic means (including email), a vote carried by majority (or two-thirds) of the votes cast (i.e., Approve or Do Not Approve votes, excluding abstentions), provided a majority of all the voting members of the Sponsor responded.

#### **7.1.1 Actions requiring approval by a majority vote**

The following actions require approval by a majority vote:

- a) Formation or modification of a subgroup, including its procedures, scope, and duties
- b) Disbandment of subgroups
- c) Approval of minutes
- d) Authorization of a Sponsor ballot
- e) Approval to jointly sponsor a project (PAR). See Clause 2.1.1

### **7.1.2 Actions requiring approval by a two-thirds vote**

The following actions require approval by a two-thirds vote:

- a) Adoption of new or revised Sponsor procedures, interest categories, or revisions thereof
- b) Approval of public statements
- c) Approval of change of the Sponsor scope\*
- d) Approval of termination of the Sponsor\*
- e) Removal of an officer except the Chair

\* Following Sponsor approval, items c and d require notice to the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

### **7.2 Approval of moving a draft standard to Sponsor ballot**

Approval for moving a draft standard to Sponsor ballot, or approval of any substantive change in the scope of a standard proposed by a subgroup, shall be referred to the Sponsor for approval. The Sponsor may delegate approval authority and form a subgroup for this purpose. Approval to move a standard to Sponsor ballot from a subgroup requires a majority vote. This vote shall be limited to procedural issues and PAR alignment only.

### **7.3 Proxy Voting**

Not applicable.

#### **7.4 Voting between meetings**

At the discretion of the Chair, the Sponsor shall be allowed to conduct voting between meetings by the use of a letter or electronic ballot. If such actions are to be taken, they shall follow the rules of IEEE Bylaw I-300.4(4).

### **8.0 Communications**

All correspondence on behalf of the Sponsor shall contain identification of the Sponsor as the source of the correspondence.

#### **8.1 Formal internal communication**

If correspondence between subcommittees or between Working groups of different subcommittees involves issues or decisions (that is, non-routine matters) affecting other subcommittees, copies shall be sent to all affected subcommittee Chairs and the Sponsor officers.

#### **8.2 External communication**

Inquiries relating to the Sponsor shall be directed to the Chair, and members shall so inform individuals who raise such questions. All replies to inquiries shall be made through the Chair.

#### **8.3 Public statements for standards**

All Sponsor public communications shall comply with the policies of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual.

Individuals making public statements that have not been approved by the Sponsor shall state that they are speaking as individuals.



### **8.3.1 Sponsor public statements**

Sponsor public statements shall not be released without prior approval as per Clause 7.1.2 of these procedures.

### **8.3.2 Subgroup public statements**

Subgroup public statements shall not be released without prior approval of the subgroup. Such public statements also require approval of the Sponsor.

Subgroup public statements shall be identified in the first paragraph of the public statement as being specifically the position of the subgroup. These statements shall be issued by the subgroup Chair and shall include the Sponsor Chair in the distribution. Such statements shall not bear the IEEE, the IEEE-SA, or the Sponsor logos.

### **8.3.3 Public statements to be issued by other entities**

If the Sponsor wishes to go to another IEEE entity (as defined in Section 15 of the IEEE Policy and Procedures) to have that entity offer a public statement on a standards matter, they shall do so after agreement from the IEEE-SA Standards Board and after informing the IEEE-SA Board of Governors. Upon Sponsor approval, proposed public statements that need to be issued by other IEEE entities shall be forwarded to the IEEE-SA Standards Board Secretary for further action.

### **8.4 Informal communications**

Informal communications shall not imply that they are a formal position of the IEEE, the IEEE-SA, or the Sponsor.

### **8.5 Standards publicity**

The Sponsor is encouraged to prepare press releases and other forms of publicity to promote their activities. Please see Clause 5.1.4 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual for further instructions.

## **9.0 Appeals**

The Sponsor recognizes the right of appeal on procedural grounds. Technical appeals are referred back to the subcommittee or Working group. Every effort shall be made to ensure that impartial handling of complaints regarding any action or inaction on the part of the Sponsor is performed in an identifiable manner.

The Sponsor shall not consider any claim that

- a) is based solely on ethical considerations;
- b) does not seek to amend or reverse a decision related to the development or approval of a standard.
- c) does not recommend remedial action, or recommends remedial action not allowed by current Sponsor and IEEE-SA policies and procedures.

IEEE-SASB Operations Manual takes precedence over these Policies and Procedures. Thus in case of absence in these Policies and Procedures of any procedural issues related to appeals the IEEE-SASB Operations Manual shall be consulted.

### **9.1 Appeal brief**

The appellant shall file a written appeal brief with the Sponsor Secretary within 30 days after the date of notification of action or following an appeal panel final decision from a subordinate committee. The appellant shall first have exhausted the appeals procedures of any relevant subordinate committees prior to filing an appeal with the Sponsor. The appeal brief shall state the nature of the objection(s) including any adverse effects, the clause(s) of the procedures or the standard(s) that are at issue, actions or inaction that are at issue, and the specific remedial action(s) that would satisfy the appellant's concerns. Previous efforts, including all subordinate appeals, to resolve the objection(s) and the statement of outcome/decision of each, including a sequence of events of these efforts, shall be provided. The appellant shall include documentation supporting all statements in the appeal brief.

All issues regarding the action or inaction of the Sponsor shall be filed together in one appeal.

The Secretary shall send the appellant a written acknowledgment of receipt of the appeal brief within five days of such receipt. The Sponsor shall review the appeal brief and determine within ten days of receipt of the appeal brief whether the appeal should be heard by the Sponsor.

If the Sponsor determines that the Sponsor should hear the appeal, the Secretary shall, within 20 days of receipt of the appeal brief, send the appellee a copy of the appeal brief and acknowledgment, and shall send the appellant and appellee a written notice of the time and location of the hearing (“hearing notice”) with the Appeal Panel.

The hearing with the Appeal Panel shall be scheduled at least 60 days after mailing of the hearing notice by the Secretary. New evidence meeting the requirements of 9.4 shall be provided at least two weeks before the date of the Appeal Panel hearing.

## **9.2 Reply brief**

Within 45 days of receipt of the hearing notice, the appellee may send the appellant and the Secretary a written reply brief, which specifically and explicitly addresses each allegation of fact in the appeal brief to the extent of the appellee's knowledge. If the appellee furnishes a reply brief, the brief shall include documentation supporting all statements contained in the reply brief.

## **9.3 Appeal Panel**

The Sponsor Chair shall appoint from the Sponsor members an Appeal Panel consisting of a chair and two other members who have not been directly involved in the matter in dispute, and who will not be materially or directly affected by any decisions made concerning the dispute. At least two members shall be acceptable to the appellant and at least two shall be acceptable to the appellee. If the parties to the appeal cannot agree on an Appeal Panel within a reasonable amount of time, the matter shall be referred to the Sponsor, which shall appoint the members of the Appeal Panel. If an Appeal Panel member resigns or is removed from the Appeal Panel at any time before the appeal hearing, then the Sponsor Chair shall appoint a replacement from the Sponsor members. The replacement shall be subject to the acceptability criteria described above.

The Secretary shall send a notice to the appellant and appellee on the acceptability of the Appeal Panel.

## **9.4 Conduct of the hearing**

The number of participating (i.e., speaking) representatives for each of the parties to the appeal is limited to a maximum of three. Other individuals may attend the hearing, but will not be permitted to address, or be addressed by, the Appeal Panel or either of the parties to the appeal at any time (including during the question and answer period). No recordings or verbatim transcriptions of the hearing are allowed.

The Appeal Panel may call an Executive Session before, during the course of, or following an appeal hearing to consider its action on a specific appeal.

Appeals Panel shall conduct hearing only in a face-to-face session. Representative of Appellant and Appellee shall be personally present at the hearing. Other speakers on Appellant and Appellee sides may participate remotely by Audio only or by Audio/Video conferencing but only upon agreement by Appeal Panel Chair, the Appellant, and the Appellee, The request directed to the Sponsor Secretary, for remote participation shall be made within 14 days after hearing announcement and

shall be made known to the Appeal parties within five days. The decision regarding acceptance of remote participation shall be made with seven days upon request.

No party to an appeal may communicate with any member of the Appeal Panel regarding the appeal while the matter is pending (i.e., from the time of filing of the appeal brief to finalization of the Appeal Panel decision).

The appellant has the burden of demonstrating adverse effects, improper action(s) or inaction, and the efficacy of the requested remedial action. Each party may adduce other pertinent arguments, and members of the Appeal Panel may address questions to individuals. The Appeal Panel shall only consider documentation included in the appeal brief and reply brief, unless

- a) Significant new evidence has come to light; and
- b) Such evidence reasonably was not available to the appellant or appellee, as appropriate, at the time of filing; and
- c) Such evidence was provided by the appellant or appellee, as appropriate, to the other parties as soon as it became available.

Prior to the hearing, the members of the Appeal Panel may convene to review the ground rules before the participants appear.

### **9.5 Appeals Panel decision**

The Appeal Panel shall not consider technical matters or make findings with respect to ethical rules, but shall limit its consideration to procedural matters. The Appeal Panel shall render its decision, based upon majority vote of the Appeal Panel (Appeal Panel members shall vote to find in favor of the appellant or the appellee and shall not abstain), in writing within 30 days of the hearing, stating findings of fact and conclusions, with reasons therefore, based on a preponderance of the evidence. Consideration may be given to the following positions, among others, in formulating the decision:

- a) Finding for the appellant, remanding the action to the appellee, with a specific statement of the issues and facts in regard to which fair and equitable action was not taken;
- b) Finding against the appellant, with a specific statement of the facts that demonstrate that appellant failed to meet its burden to demonstrate that fair and equitable treatment of the appellant was not taken;
- c) Finding that new, substantive evidence has been introduced, and remanding the entire action to the appropriate committee for reconsideration.

Appeal panel should exercise its best judgment in keeping the hearings and the Appeal Panel decision within the scope of the Appeal and not issue judgments or recommendations to the parties of the Appeal or to the Sponsor that fall outside of the Appeal scope.

The Appeal Panel Chair, through the Sponsor, shall notify the appellant, the appellee, and the Sponsor members in writing of the decision of the Appeal Panel.

If an Appeal Panel member resigns or is removed after a hearing, then the remaining two members of the Appeal Panel may issue a decision if their decision is unanimous. If it is not unanimous, then the Sponsor Chair shall appoint a replacement from the Sponsor members and a re-hearing shall be conducted.